When do governments deserve our allegiance, and when should they be denied it? This course explores the main answers that have been given to this question in the modern west. We start with a survey of the major political theories of the Enlightenment: Utilitarianism, Marxism, and the social contract tradition. In each case we start with a look of classical formulations, locating them in historical context, but then shift to the contemporary debates as they relate to politics today.

Next we turn to the rejection of Enlightenment political thinking, again exploring both classical and contemporary formulations. The last part of the course deals with the nature of, and justifications for, democratic politics, and their relations to Enlightenment and Anti-Enlightenment political thinking.

In addition to exploring theoretical differences among the various authors discussed, considerable attention is devoted to the practical implications of their competing arguments. To this end, we discuss a variety of concrete problems, including debates about economic inequality, affirmative action and the distribution of health care, the limits of state power in the regulation of speech and religion, and difficulties raised by the emerging threat of global environmental decay. There are no prerequisites.

**Requirements**

- **Regular Students:** Take-home midterm (30%, due March 2\textsuperscript{nd}); in-class final (50%); section participation (20%).

- **Writing-intensive students:** Papers (50%); in-class final (30%); section participation (20%).

  Paper due dates:

  - Paper 1: Rough draft: Feb 15  Final draft: Feb 29
  - Paper 2: Rough draft: April 9  Final draft: Apr 23

**Key**

- YB = On sale at the Yale Bookstore on Broadway Street
- R = In reader, on sale at Tyco on Elm Street
- B = On reserve at Bass Library
- If a reading is hyperlinked, it is available on eReserves; click and log in using your Net ID. (Some links require you to be on the Yale network; if off campus, connect using VPN).
COURSE SYLLABUS AND SCHEDULE OF CLASSES

Monday, January 9
Informational and housekeeping session

I. ENLIGHTENMENT POLITICAL THEORY

Wednesday, January 11
Introductory lecture
Required:

Suggested:
- Arendt, *Eichmann*, the rest

*Friday, January 13 (Friday classes do not meet; Monday classes meet instead)*
Natural law roots of the enlightenment

Required:
- Descartes, “Discourse on the Method” Parts 2 and 4 and “Principles of Philosophy” Part I, Items 1-8 in *The Philosophical Writings of Descartes* Vol.1 (R, B)

Suggested:
- Locke, *First Treatise of Government*, VI-VII (YB, B)
- Ian Shapiro, *Moral Foundations of Politics*, Ch. 1 (YB, B)


II. UTILITARIANISM: CLASSICAL AND NEOCLASSICAL

*Wednesday, January 18 (All sections start this week)*
Origins of classical utilitarianism
Required:

Suggested:
- Bentham, *Introduction* ..., Chs. 5, 6

Monday, January 23
Classical utilitarianism and distributive justice
Required:

Suggested:
- Elie Halévy, *The Growth of Philosopich Radicalism*, Part I Chs.1 & 3 and Part II Chs. 1-3 (B)
- Shapiro, *Moral Foundations of Politics*, Ch. 2 (YB, B)
**Wednesday, January 25**  
From classical to neoclassical utilitarianism  
*Required:*  
*Suggested:*  
- Shapiro, *Moral Foundations of Politics*, Ch. 3 (YB, B)

**Monday, January 30**  
The neoclassical synthesis of rights and utility  
*Required:*  
- Mill, *On Liberty*, Chs. 3-4 (YB, B)  
*Suggested:*  
- Mill, *Utilitarianism*, Chs. 1-3 (B)

**Wednesday, February 1**  
Limits of the neoclassical synthesis  
*Required:*  
- Mill, *On Liberty*, Ch. 5 (YB, B)  
*Suggested:*  
- Mill, *Utilitarianism*, Chs 4-5 (B)

III. MARXISM, ITS FAILURES AND ITS LEGACY

**Note:** Page numbers for Marx readings are from *The Marx-Engels Reader*, ed. Tucker (YB, B).

**Monday, February 6**  
The Marxian challenge  
*Required:*  
*Suggested:*  

**Wednesday, February 8**  
Marx’s theory of capitalism  
*Required:*  
*Suggested:*  

**Monday, February 13**  
Marxian exploitation and distributive justice  
*Required:*  
- Marx, *Critique of the Gotha Program*, pp. 525-41  
*Suggested:*  
Wednesday, February 15
The Marxian failure and legacy

Required:
- Marx, “Crisis Theory” (Ch XVII of *Theories of Surplus Value*), pp. 443-65
- J. Roemer, “Should Marxists be interested in exploitation?” *Analytical Marxism* (R)

Suggested:
- Shapiro, *Moral Foundations of Politics*, Ch. 4 (YB, B)

---

IV. THE SOCIAL CONTRACT TRADITION

Monday, February 22
Secularizing natural law

Required:
- Kant, *Groundwork for the Metaphysics of Morals*, 2nd Section (esp. 37-49) (R, O)

Suggested:

Wednesday, February 22
The Rawlsian social contract

Required:
- John Rawls, *A Theory of Justice*, Ch. 1 §4; Ch. 2 §11-12 and §14-15 (YB, B)

Suggested:
- Rawls, *A Theory of Justice*, Ch. 1 §1-3; Ch.2 §13 and §16-17

Monday, February 27
Distributive justice and the welfare state

Required:
- Rawls, *Theory...*, Ch. 3 §20-22, §24-26, §29-30; Ch. 4 §40

Suggested:
- Rawls, *Theory...*, Ch. 3 §23 and §27; Ch.5 §41-43, Ch. 9 §79
- Nozick, *Anarchy, State and Utopia*, pp. 183-231 (YB, B)
- Shapiro, *Moral Foundations of Politics*, Ch.5 (YB, B)

Wednesday, February 29
The “political-not-metaphysical” legacy

Required:
- Shapiro, “Justice and Workmanshp in a Democracy” in *Democracy’s Place* (R, B)

(Spring Recess: Saturday March 3 – Sunday March 18)

Monday, March 19
The Nozickian minimal state

Required:
- Robert Nozick, *Anarchy, State and Utopia*, Chs. 1-3 (YB, B)
Wednesday, March 21
Rights-as-side constraints and the minimal state

Required:
- Nozick, Anarchy..., Ch. 4

Suggested:
- Nozick, Anarchy..., Chs. 5, 8-10

Monday, March 26
Compensation versus redistribution

Required:
- Nozick, Anarchy..., Chs. 6 & 7, pp. 149-64 & 167-82

V. ANTI-ENLIGHTENMENT POLITICS

Wednesday, March 28
The Burkean outlook

Required:
- Edmund Burke, Reflections on the Revolution in France (Yale University Press), pp. 3-45, 77-83 (YB, B)
- Patrick Devlin, Morals and the Criminal Law (R)

Suggested:
- David Bromwich, “Introduction to Burke,” in Empire, Liberty, and Reform (R, B).
- Burke, Reflections (YB, B), the rest.

Monday, April 2
Contemporary communitarianism

Required:
- Alasdair MacIntyre, After Virtue, Chs. 1-3, 5 (YB, B)

Suggested:
- MacIntyre, After Virtue, Chs. 4 & 6-8

Wednesday, April 4
Contemporary communitarianism

Required:
- MacIntyre, After Virtue, Chs. 9, 14

Suggested:
- MacIntyre, After Virtue, Chs. 10-12, 13, 15-19
- Shapiro, Moral Foundations of Politics, Ch. 6 (YB, B)

VI. DEMOCRACY

Monday, April 9
Republicanism vs. democracy

Required:

Suggested:
- Ibid. Papers No. 9, 10, 15, 16, 17, 23, 47, 49, 55, 58, 63, 84, 85.

**Wednesday, April 11**

Democracy I: the general will and its children

*Required:*
  • Jean-Jacques Rousseau, *The Social Contract*, Book I Ch. 6-7, Book II Ch. 3 (R)
  • Jürgen Habermas, “Three Normative Models of Democracy” (R)
  • James Fishkin, “Deliberative Polling: Toward a Better-Informed Democracy” (R)

*Suggested:*
  • Shapiro, *The State of Democratic Theory*, Ch.1 (B)
  • James Fishkin, *The Voice of the People* or his online lecture on deliberative democracy.

**Monday, April 16**

Democracy II: majority rule

*Required:*
  • Locke, *Second Treatise of Government*, Chs. X, XVII-XIX (YB, B)
  • Joseph Schumpeter, *Capitalism, Socialism, and Democracy*, Ch. XXI and XXII (R)
  • Buchanan and Tullock, *The Calculus of Consent*, excerpt from Ch.6 (R)

*Suggested:*
  • Shapiro, “John Locke’s Democratic Theory,” in Locke’s *Two Treatises of Government* (YB, B)
  • William H. Riker, Ch. 5, “The Meaning of Social Choice” in *Liberalism against Populism* (R)

**Wednesday, April 18**

Final lecture: Democracy, Science, and Rights

*Required:*
  • John Dewey, “The Ethics of Democracy” and excerpts from *Individualism, Old and New* (R)
  • Shapiro, *Democracy’s Place*, Ch.8 (R, B)
  • Shapiro, *The Real World of Democratic Theory*, Ch. 2 (R, B)

*Suggested:*
  • Shapiro, *The State of Democratic Theory*, Ch. 2-3 (B) and Ch. 5 (R, B)
  • Shapiro, *Moral Foundations of Politics*, Ch. 7-8 (YB, B)

**Monday, April 23**

No class; Friday classes meet instead.

**Review session** will be scheduled during reading week (April 23-27).